

# Scrutiny Committee Minutes

**Thursday 01 June 2023**

**Carriageworks Theatre, The Electric Press. 3 Millennium Square, Leeds,  
LS2 3AD**

**Present:**

**Attendee**

Cllr Paul Haslam (Chair)  
Cllr Rhys Furley  
Cllr Matthew Salter  
Cllr Damian O'Connor  
Cllr John Davison  
Cllr Andy Connell  
Cllr Manisha Kaushik

**Local Authority**

North Yorkshire;  
Hull;  
Lancashire;  
Liverpool City Region;  
North Lincolnshire;  
Westmorland and Furness;  
West Yorkshire Combined Authority;

**Officers in Attendance:**

**Name**

Matt Smallwood  
Gary Rich  
Julie Openshaw  
Charlie French  
Angela Harwood  
Katie Day

**Job Title**

Connected Mobility Manager  
Democratic Services Officer  
Head of Legal  
Investment Planning Manager  
Senior Solicitor  
Strategy, Analysis and  
Communications Director

**Item No:**

**1 Welcome & Apologies**

- 1.1 The Chair welcomed all in attendance and informed Members that the meeting was being recorded and would be added to the website following the meeting. Apologies were received from Cllrs Parish, Fletcher, Dixon, Cooper and Melly.

**2 Declarations of Interest**

- 2.1 Cllr Merrett declared that he is employed by Amey and undertakes bridge assessments contract work for Network Rail. He is also a member of a Transport activist group.

**3 Minutes of the Previous Meeting**

- 3.1 The minutes of the meeting held on 2 March 2023 were considered and their accuracy as a correct record confirmed. The minutes were proposed by Cllr Salter and seconded by Cllr Davidson.

- 3.2 Cllr Merrett asked if there had been any update as to when the Terms of Reference of the Leeds Area Study are due to be published.

The Investment Planning Manager explained that confirmation is still awaited from the DfT.

**Resolved:**

That the minutes of the meeting held on 2 March 2023 be approved as a true and accurate record.

**4 Election of the Chair and the Majority & Minority Group Vice Chairs**

- 4.1 The Majority Group Vice Chair Cllr Kaushik took the Chair and invited nominations for the position of Chair of the Committee. Cllr Haslam was nominated by Cllr Salter and seconded by Cllr Davidson and elected unopposed.
- 4.2 The Chair invited nominations to the position of Majority group Vice Chair. Cllr Kaushik was proposed by Cllr Merrett and seconded by Cllr Davison and elected unopposed.
- 4.3 The appointment of the minority group Vice Chair was deferred until the following meeting.

**Resolved:**

- 1) That Cllr Haslam be appointed as Chair of the Transport for the North Scrutiny Committee for the 2023/24 Municipal Year
- 2) That Cllr Kaushik be appointed as majority group Vice Chair of the Transport for the North Scrutiny Committee for the 2023/24 Municipal Year.
- 3) That the appointment of the minority group vice chair be deferred.

**5 Scrutiny Committee work 2022-2023**

- 5.1 Members received the report from the Democratic Services Officer outlining the work the Committee had undertaken in the previous year.
- 5.2 Cllr Kaushik raised the question of sharing confidential papers with officers. The Head of Legal Services explained that any confidential papers would be marked as such as would happen in their own authorities.

**Resolved:**

That the report be noted.

**6 Manchester Statutory Advice Update**

- 6.1 Members received the report from the Investment Planning Manager who outlined the key points within the report.
- 6.2 Cllr Davison raised the issue of services to Manchester Airport and requested the recommendation in the report include that trains continue on to Manchester Airport after leaving Manchester Piccadilly.

The Investment Planning Manager explained that in order for this to be possible he would need to look at the bounds of possibility of this happening with the current infrastructure and then look at what extra infrastructure will be required in order to do so without impacting other services.

- 6.3 The Chair continued the theme on Manchester Airport and stated that he would like to see what financial impact this would have on Manchester Airport and the local economy. He expressed disappointment that the removal of services to Manchester Airport is causing social inequalities as well as not creating opportunities for modal shift.

- 6.4 Cllr Kaushik asked about the December 2023 timetable changes.

- 6.5 The investment Planning Manager explained that there is a formal consultation process that the operators are undertaking.

- 6.6 Cllr Furley highlighted that the report makes no mention of electrification and decarbonisation. He also highlighted the need for compliance with accessibility law.

- 6.7 Cllr Parish had submitted a number of comments that he wanted to be addressed, and these were shared with the Committee.

The Investment Planning Manager suggested that he responds to these questions offline and the Chair requested that the answers be shared with all Committee Members.

- 6.8 The Chair requested that two additional outcomes be included in the report going to the Transport for the North Board, namely the inclusion of decarbonisation and social inequalities.

- 6.9 The Strategy, Analysis and Communications Director explained that this work has been taking place in parallel to the work being undertaken on the Strategic Transport Plan. She highlighted the three core ambitions of economic performance, decarbonisation and reducing transport related social exclusion. She explained that there is an opportunity to strengthen the advice as this is currently at the heart of TfN activity.

### **Resolved:**

- 1) That the Committee welcomes the successful delivery of Configuration State 1 infrastructure and implementation of the December 2022 timetable change

- 2) That the Committee welcomes the commitment from the Department for Transport to fund delivery of infrastructure in Configuration State 2 alongside the continued development of Configuration State 3
- 3) That the Committee endorses the proposed update to Transport for the North's Statutory Advice for Manchester for consideration by Transport for the North's Board
- 4) That decarbonisation and social inequalities be added as additional outcomes to the Board report.

## **7 TfN Decarbonisation Priority Activities Update'**

7.1 Members received the report of Principal Environmental and Sustainability Officer and the Strategy, Analysis and Communications Director outlined the key aspects of the report.

7.2 Cllr Furley raised the issue of getting freight back on to rail and believes that this is a step forward and wanted to know how it would look.

In response the Strategy, Analysis and Communications Director stated that TfN will be examining with partners what is necessary to implement this ambition, using the evidence base to provide advice/priorities for investment. She explained that a right share target for freight has been included in the revised Strategic Transport Plan, which is being consulted upon, to test the ambition the North wishes to have to shift freight from road and rail.

7.3 Cllr Merrett enquired about accessibility and whether tools such as visualisers are being made available to the wider public.

The Strategy, Analysis and Communications Director confirmed that the Electric Vehicle Charging Infrastructure (EVCI) and the Transport Related Social Exclusion (TRSE) tools are available on the TfN website. She added that the clean mobility and hydrogen tools are being developed and hoped that these will also be able to be added to the website.

Cllr Merrett asked whether there will be a communications strategy with the decarbonisation strategy.

7.4 On the issue of hydrogen Cllr Salter stated that whilst the focus on hydrogen is on larger vehicles, he requested that smaller and private vehicles are not forgotten. He referred to those who are economically less well off, tradespeople and those who have to use their vehicles for work of and stated that these people should not be priced out.

7.5 In response the Strategy, Analysis and Communications Director stated that TfN is looking at alternative fuels. On the issue of light freight, she expected this to be further examined as part of TfN's work on freight and logistics in future. She stated that she would take away the points raised and include them within the thinking/forward planning for the work.

- 7.6 Cllr Davison spoke about the importance of moving freight out of lorries and on to rail because even by using hydrogen and electric there is still tyre pollution and congestion which are major causes to pollution. He then highlighted the importance of inter modals, where there has been little investment.

In response the Strategy, Analysis and Communications Director explained that a whole system approach needs to be taken with regard to transport which includes digital connectivity as well as the energy needs and distribution, and taking a broad view of potential impacts/benefits.

- 7.7 The Chair suggested that that all the work mentioned should be shared with council officers (where not done so already) as well as being available to the public. He highlighted the importance of quantified carbon reduction plans with quantified targets in order that corrections can be made along the way. The Chair opined that the national grid is the biggest block to new energy.

The Chair also stated that the Committee welcomes TfN's commitment to wanting Northern Powerhouse Rail (NPR) in full, HS2 and Transpennine Route Upgrade (TRU).

**Resolved:**

That the report and feedback be noted and that it be used on future proposed TfN decarbonisation activities and priorities for TfN's Decarbonisation Strategy update due for 2025.

## **8 Connected Mobility Strategy**

- 8.1 Members received the report and presentation from the Connected Mobility Manager who highlighted the key elements within the presentation.
- 8.2 The Chair stated that the approach needs to be more granular as people have different travel habits creating different outcomes.

The Connected Mobility Manager explained that there was an output from the former IST Programme where a set of consumer personas were created. He suggested updating the personas from a post pandemic viewpoint and checking their relevance and then focusing research on them. He explained that from a user perspective, fare structures can't be made on the basis that everyone has the same travel habits and he agreed that this needs to be included in the current work.

- 8.3 Cllr Kaushik questioned whether work would take place with the operators.

The Connected Mobility Manager explained that the approach would need to be tailored for geographical regions. For a city region the default position needs to be a fully integrated network which takes away the challenge of multiple operators.

With regard to areas outside of this there need to be governance and administration structures around the schemes that make it easier for operators working in multiple areas to engage with them. A standardised approach needs to be taken within these areas to assist operators but it will have passenger variation. Ticketing arrangements will need to be looked at with standardised governance that ensures that operators will be involved from the outset.

Cllr Kaushik then raised the issue with regards to generational differences in paying.

The Connected Mobility Manager confirmed that fares reform is currently a big issue.

8.4 The Chair expressed his concern that it costs three to four times more to use transport in the north of England than it does in London and asked to see numbers to illustrate benefits for people.

8.5 Cllr Davison opined that the former IST programme failed due to bus operators not being interested in being involved and asked what has changed now.

The Connected Mobility Manager explained that the previous programme was a capital heavy delivery programme. The position has now changed, and the technical systems are a lot less complicated. He explained that authorities and operators are aligned and revised emphasis is building up from existing work collaboratively across public and private sector.

8.6 Cllr Salter described the Executive Summary as 'dull' and suggested that this be re-examined.

He referred to the graph on page.48 of the pack and using London as an example where use increases as a result of investment, suggested this could be used as an argument for increased spending on public transport in the North.

The Connected Mobility Manager agreed that the Executive Summary will be refreshed. On the point around the usage map he explained that the increase in usage was as a result of the Elizabeth Line opening and previous London Underground use now reporting with national rail. the report to Board will have a caveat included in it.

The Chair requested that further work be undertaken on the Executive Summary.

**Resolved:**

- 1) That the report be noted;
- 2) That the comments of the Committee be noted.

**9 Date and Time of Next Meeting**

Tuesday 5 September  
11am  
Microsoft Teams